Evaluating the impacts of plantations and associated forestry operations in Africa
methods and indicators

Verina Ingram, Edwin van der Werf
Enoch Kikulwe, Justus Wesseler

FLARE Conference 28 November 2015 Paris

Session 8 Issues in measuring the impact of interventions for empirical applications
Introduction

- Investments in large-scale forest plantations & associated activities believed to:
  - promote poverty alleviation & development
  - satisfy the rising demand for forest products
  - mitigate pressure on natural resources, deforestation & climate change.

- But, potential beneficial impacts debated - adverse effects indicated

Aim

- Contribute to knowledge and methods - framework to examine the impacts of major investments by private sector, institutional investors and governments in modern, large scale plantations

- Cases in East Africa
Methodology

- Review 43 publications: impacts and outcomes of plantation forestry & associated activities
- Field visits: Private & government, large & small-scale, certified & non-certified pine & eucalyptus plantations; Tanzania
- Finance Alliance for Sustainable Trade working group impact indicators meetings
- Interviews value chain stakeholders:
  - 5 IFI & national investors
  - 12 plantation managers and staff
  - 39 temporary workers
  - 1 state and 21 private sector small/large scale pole suppliers
  - 4 private sector and government clients for wood products
  - 2 focus group meetings communities near plantations
Key impact evaluation questions

What are the impacts of the industrial and plantation activities on:

- Sustainable business income?
- Private sector economic activity?
- Sustainable economic growth?

Theory change- indicators - data collection and analysis methods
Theory of Change
What can be measured?

- **Outcomes**
  - Outcomes more plausibly caused and attributed directly to plantation and industrial activities;
  - Impacts in the theory of change - very difficult to measure and attribute to company or investor.

- **Timescale**
  - Environmental 4-20 years, tree growth and cutting cycle dependent.
  - Social impacts often seasonal & associated with silvicultural activities, vary significantly between acquisition, establishment and mature plantation phases, dependent upon product development and marketing. Post baseline – 3-4 years
  - Economic- investment cycle related and if tied investment
Indicators - outcome level

1. Good return for shareholders, owners & lenders
2. Worker’s income increases
3. Worker’s living conditions improve
4. Positive impacts suppliers
5. Employment
6. Positive impacts on customers
7. Positive impacts on local economic development
8. Increased government revenues
9. Increased/ improved availability/access to infrastructure
10. Improved environmental outcomes
11. Climate change mitigation/carbon sink
12. Good stakeholder relations
13. Increased biological asset value
14. Improved social outcomes
15. Employees work under safer and healthier conditions
16. Employee training
17. Demonstration of responsible corporate operations
Approach

- Using **investment treatment** and **control groups** feasible for communities
- **Counterfactual** for industrial operations where no suitable “control” for comparison
- **Baseline and impact measurement** - minimum 2 rounds of interviews with stakeholders
- Complement **quantitative** methods with **qualitative** methods and **market models**
- Large number of **interviews** needed as stakeholders (esp. workers) could move out of area between the two rounds
Data collection

- Multi source
- Primary and secondary
- Household
- Company data
Issues

- Testing in Mozambique and Tanzania 2016 and 2018/2019
- Can private and government plantations be compared?
- Compatibility of indicators with existing reporting systems (G4, GIIN, FSC/PEFC, CCBA, ISO, CDM/VCS certification)
- Meaningfulness of indicators for the full range of stakeholders
- Applicability in a range of ecosystems and contexts - including dry and humid forests - and social contexts?
- Applicable for investments in natural forests?
- Need to track the costs, advantages and disadvantages, feasibility, effectiveness and efficiency of gathering data on the indicators.
Questions?

verina.ingram@wur.nl